

# STAFF REPORT

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWN OF COBOURG



<b>Report to:</b>	Mayor and Council Members	<b>Priority:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Low
<b>Submitted by:</b>	Laurie Wills Director, Public Works lwills@cobourg.ca	<b>Meeting Type:</b>	Open Session <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Closed Session <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Meeting Date:</b>	January 24, 2022		
<b>Report No.:</b>	Public Works-083-22		
<a href="#">Submit comments to Council</a>			

**Subject/Title: Parking Rate Increase Proposal - Update**

## RECOMMENDATION:

THAT Council receive the enclosed report for information purposes; and,  
FURTHER THAT Council direct Staff to conduct a public information meeting to present the proposed parking opportunities and rate increases on February 7, 2022; and,  
FURTHER THAT the parking rate increase proposal be added to the February 14, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting.

Notices were circulated to all residents/addresses within the subject new paid parking area east of Victoria Park.

The DBIA board and all members also received a copy of the notice regarding proposed increased rates for downtown meters and lots.

Staff are proposing that a public meeting be held virtually on February 7, 2022 to share a presentation that summarizes and explains the proposed parking opportunities and rate increases.

## 3. PURPOSE

To provide Council with an update on the parking rate increase proposal.

#### 4. ORIGIN AND LEGISLATION

November 15<sup>th</sup>, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting

- Public Works Report No. 066-21

December 6<sup>th</sup>, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting

- Public Works Report No. 079-21

#### 5. BACKGROUND

On November 15, 2021, Staff provided a parking rate increase proposal to Council in response to historical requests for an increase in parking revenue, investigate paid parking opportunities east of Victoria Park and in response to recommendations of the Waterfront Working Group and Parks and Recreation Advisory Committee Beach survey.

On December 6, 2021, Staff provided a recommendation to Council that all comments received during public consultation be forwarded to the Waterfront Working Group who were to meet in early January to discuss and summarize recommendations to Council at the January 24, 2022 Committee of the Whole meeting. A summary of comments has been attached.

#### 6. ANALYSIS

All received comments were circulated to the Waterfront Working Group on December 14, 2021 and the group met together to discuss comments on January 6, 2022. The following is a summary of the details included in Public Works Report No. 066-21 that have been updated to reflect the consensus of the Waterfront Working Group in response to the public comments received to date.

##### **Downtown Tiered Rate Parking Lots**

In 2022, in accordance with the recommendations of the 2014 Cobourg Downtown Parking Study, Staff are proposing to divide the parking lots into the following categories:

##### **Premium Lots**

Covert Street  
Second Street  
Albert Street (Nov-April)  
Third Street

##### **Secondary Lots**

Trinity  
Hibernia Street  
McGill Street (Nov-April)

*\*Premium parking passes are valid in all downtown municipal parking lots.*

The objective of the tiered parking lots is to encourage use of the secondary lots for longer parking usages (downtown employees) which in turn encourages more turnover within higher demand parking areas for shoppers and clients, etc.

Due to the substantial changes to parking that are being proposed, the two tiered parking lot approach is recommended to be deferred for consideration at another time. A tiered approach may be more applicable after other proposed changes have been implemented and parking trends have been observed for a year or more.

## **Waterfront Parking**

The following is a proposal for changes to the existing paid parking areas as well as the addition of new areas for paid waterfront parking.

### *Existing Paid Parking Area Improvements*

Currently, waterfront parking is as per Figure 1 whereby fees are only charged from Victoria Day weekend to Thanksgiving weekend. Parking is offered for payment utilizing a mix of coin meters and pay & display machines. At \$2/hour and 8 hours/day maximum between the hours of 8am-6pm, the machines are filled frequently and require by-law enforcement do collection several times per week in order to ensure machines are not jammed up by being over filled and causing revenue loss. Finance also requires significant resources on a weekly basis (4-12 hours) to dry, sort, count and deposit coin.

Based on observed highly utilized usage of parking all year on: Third Street south of Albert Street; Queen Street between Division Street and McGill Street; and Albert Street during the summer months especially, Staff are proposing to include these locations in the waterfront parking area as shown in Figure 2.

Staff are also recommending that the Albert Street Lot be added to the waterfront parking as it is highly utilized in the summer months due to its close proximity to the beach for overflow as well as for visitors to the trailer park. If the Albert Street lot is added to the waterfront parking area, it would not be available for monthly parking passes for the summer months and there would be no free hours offered during the summer months. A pay & display machine would also be required and would service the on-street parking on Albert Street as well. In the winter months, this lot would have the option of monthly passes and pay & display hourly parking at the same rate as the downtown.

In order to best facilitate these improvements Staff are recommending that the cash only parking meters be replaced with pay & display machines or credit card meters. By providing a method for credit card/debit payment, resource time commitments will be reduced for by-law and finance and there will be more flexibility for increasing hourly rates and implementing daily passes as will be discussed further within.

Regarding the Waterfront Working Group's suggestion to have permit only or reserved parking spaces for purchase in waterfront lots, this would not be recommended for the Town to incorporate into operations. Each parking space would have to be identifiable either by signs or pavement markings. Signs can easily be stolen or relocated; pavement markings are not feasible in gravel lots. It would be expected that people who have reserved a spot will find their spot already occupied upon their arrival and By-law / police would be inundated with calls and

complaints to have cars removed/towed and/or for refunds. Also, reserving spaces would limit revenue generation as there would be no possibility of space turnover during the day i.e. Someone could reserve and pay for the day and then not use it or leave after a short time leaving the space unoccupied.

Enforcement hours are proposed to be increased from between 8:00am and 6:00pm to 9:00am and 8:00pm (11 hours). The change in enforcement hours allows locals to utilize the waterfront area in the morning prior to paid parking hours and extends the period when paid parking can be enforced during the busy evening hours. The eight (8) hour maximum time limit for daily parking would be eliminated.

### *Proposed New Paid Waterfront Parking Areas*

Waterfront paid parking is limited and it is evident that the beach area is extremely busy in the summer with parked vehicles lining residential streets in close proximity to the beach where parking is free. Currently there is no daily waterfront rate or pass due to the limited availability of spots. Buying a parking pass in advance is too much of a risk for visitors since there would be a good chance that there is no available paid waterfront parking remaining by the time they arrive.

Staff are recommending expanding the paid parking areas to include the residential streets to the southeast of Victoria Park as described below and illustrated in Figure 3.

- Queen Street from Church Street to D'Arcy Street
- Perry Street from Paul Currelly Way to D'Arcy Street
- Bay Street from Green Street to D'Arcy Street
- Green Street from King Street East to Bay Street
- Henry Street from King Street East to Water Street

Parking spots are already delineated on most of the identified streets with the exception of Henry Street, and Green Street. In total, the additional paid parking spots that could be added in this residential area is approximately 176.

On King Street in front of St. Peter's Church, Staff are proposing a 15 minute drop off location be implemented at the furthest west parking spot (for ease of access) as well as an accessible parking spot where a curb cut already exists. King Street has been removed from the proposed paid parking area (35 spots). Parking is still permitted on King Street as it is currently permitted for free.

### *Proposed New Daily Waterfront Pass*

Installing meters or pay & displays in a residential area is not desirable for the local residents, the cost is substantial for installation and maintenance, and there is often not enough sunlight to power the pay & display machines which operate on battery stored solar power. The resource requirement to maintain and empty the pay machines would not be sustainable. Typically, the waterfront area is free parking during the winter months and the pay & display machines are removed and stored indoors to protect them from the elements and to prevent vandalism. Installing and removing the number of machines or meters that would be required in this area would not be feasible from a resource or storage perspective.

Paid parking in these new residential areas will be best managed by issuing a daily parking pass that will only be available for purchase online either in advance or on the day of use. Passes will not be required to be printed or displayed as the license plate will be registered to the paid pass instantaneously. By-law enforcement will simply have to enter the license plate number to check if parking has been paid.

Upon the purchase of a pass, purchasers will be required to read and acknowledge that parking is only available on a first come-first served basis, there will be no guarantee of obtaining a parking spot, and there will be no refunds if a spot cannot be located. Daily passes will be valid for all areas outlined in the waterfront parking area map (Figure 4).

Minimal signage will be required on the proposed residential streets, identifying the dates when paid daily parking is enforced. An additional small amount of pavement marking would also be beneficial to delineate the new parking stalls on the streets that currently are not marked. The pavement marking helps to ensure that cars are not blocking driveways or sight lines at intersecting streets.

As a result of public comments received, the hours of enforcement will be limited to between 9:00am and 4:00pm. This will allow the local daycare business to continue operation with parent drop off and pick up times existing outside of the enforcement hours. Additional passes for daytime staff parking may be negotiated upon request with Council approval. The proposed enforcement time will also allow for local residents to have visitors come and go more easily and for residents to park in front of their homes before and after typical working hours without having to obtain a pass.

A concern of how contractors and visitors can park in the neighbourhood will be addressed through the utilization of the new resident waterfront pass as described below. The new pass allows for license plates to be changed to accommodate visitors. Residents will simply need to change the plate number online or call into the Town. Alternatively, with the new resident pass, residents can park on the road to allow visitors and contractors to park in the driveway.

#### *Proposed New Resident Waterfront Seasonal Pass*

In response to the Beach User Survey and Waterfront Working Group's suggestion, Staff are proposing that a resident waterfront seasonal pass be established. The resident pass would be valid for the same time period as all waterfront paid parking is enforced between Victoria Day and Thanksgiving. Passes would be valid at all waterfront parking areas as well as the southeast waterfront neighbourhood as illustrated in Figure 4.

In order for a resident to purchase a waterfront seasonal pass, documentation will be required showing proof of ownership or residence. Seasonal resident waterfront passes are proposed to cost the same as a daily pass with the exception of residents who live in the southeast waterfront neighbourhood who will receive a 50% discount. Resident seasonal passes will have the ability to register two (2) vehicle license plates to share with household members or visitors. License plate numbers can be changed at any time using the online AIMS parking pass system

or calling into the Town however, only one vehicle can use the pass at any given time.

In 2009, the Town of Cobourg's former Parking Committee forwarded a motion to Council requesting parking meters be installed on Church Street and Charles Street and further that residents on Church and Charles be provided with one (1) free parking pass. Staff are recommending that Church Street and Charles Street residents be required to purchase a 50% discounted resident waterfront parking pass to maintain consistency and fairness among residents with regards to paid parking in the southeast area of Victoria Park.

In response to the Beach User Survey, a new pilot is being also proposed to try utilizing the Charles Street parking lot as 'resident only' parking. Only those who have purchased a Resident Waterfront Seasonal Pass will have a first-come-first-served opportunity to park in the Charles Street lot. No other passes will be valid at the Charles Street lot.

#### *Proposed New Resident Accessible Parking Permit*

As part of the Town of Cobourg's commitment to accessibility and reducing barriers, the Town believes that with the ability to purchase daily permits at the waterfront as well as seasonal resident waterfront passes, this will make parking far more accessible for those with accessible permits as it can sometimes be very challenging to access a pay and display machine or meter. The proposed daily and seasonal resident parking permit has been supported by the Accessibility Advisory Committee in a motion of support submitted to Council in 2021.

Another consideration for Council that would further increase the accessibility of parking in Cobourg is a Resident Accessible Downtown Parking Permit and a Resident Accessible Waterfront Parking Permit. This permit would be available for Cobourg residents with Ontario issued Accessible Parking Permits to purchase at a cost equal to the seasonal resident waterfront pass and equal to the downtown parking lot pass. The pass would allow residents with an accessible permit to park anywhere where paid parking is permitted, including on street parking in the downtown, and not have to pay at location. Staff have over the years heard that those with Accessible Permits want to be treated equitably and pay for parking like everyone else. Staff have also heard that sometimes paying for parking on location, due to weather conditions, events, and method of payment sometimes can be a challenge.

### **Downtown On-Street Parking**

#### *Rates*

As noted previously, the downtown parking lots have a minimal fee of \$15/month or \$5/day as well as a downtown metered rate of \$1/hr or \$10/day. For anyone wanting to visit the beach for the day, those could be the desirable locations to park due to the lower daily costs in comparison to the current and proposed waterfront parking rates.

Should an increase be applied to the waterfront parking rates, a downtown (lots and metered) parking rate increase is also required otherwise beach goers could

tend to park further away in the downtown core where cheaper rates exist for the day.

### *Existing and Proposed Parking Infrastructure*

In 2021, the Town replaced parking meters on King Street from Hibernia Street to McGill Street on the north and south sides with pay & display machines. The benefits of switching to pay & display machines are as follows:

- ✓ minimal maintenance requirements
- ✓ less replacement parts needed on hand
- ✓ less maintenance staff resources required for repairs
- ✓ less snow removal expenses
- ✓ frees up By-law enforcement resources required to collect coin
- ✓ frees up finance resources required to dry, sort, count, and deposit collected coin
- ✓ less vandalism opportunity/less chance of lost revenue
- ✓ more attractive aesthetic for downtown
- ✓ credit card payment option

In the 2022 budget, Staff are proposing to proceed with additional pay & display machines to replace older meters in the downtown core where parking is concentrated such as Division Street north of King Street (west side), Third Street between King and Albert (west side), and Second Street. Incorporating credit card payment for parking will more easily permit rate increases and reduce mechanical failure/loss of revenue due to the amount of coin input/collection requirements with higher hourly/daily rates.

Should Council approve an hourly rate increase in the downtown, the older parking meters are not capable of being updated to a different rate and will be required to be replaced. In areas where there are not enough parking spots to be serviced by a pay & display machine, parking meters will be replaced with newer meters that accept credit card payments. If the waterfront meters are changed out due to a rate increase, there are many newer mechanisms that can be salvaged and used in the downtown instead of replacement.

Also, in 2022, Staff are proposing to implement paid parking with credit card meters on King Street (north side) between Spring Street and Ball Street. Currently these parking spots permit 1-hour free parking however turnover is reported to be minimal or non-existent. Meters have never existed at this location.

### *Maximum Time Allotment*

As recommended in the 2014 parking study, the maximum parking time allotment for a downtown metered area should be reduced from eight (8) hours to encourage turnover of shoppers and discourage beach/daily parking in close proximity to businesses. Staff are suggesting a three (3) hour time limit which does not prohibit parking for longer than three hours, however it requires the meter/pay and display machine to be topped up every three hours either manually or online utilizing Honk mobile.

### *Proposed Daily Pass Changes*

Currently there is a \$5/day parking pass available that is valid in any downtown municipal parking lot. Considering the proximity of many parking lots in Cobourg to the beach, this is an extremely low rate for parking especially during the summer months. In order to establish increased waterfront parking rates, the daily pass is being recommended to increase in fees as well as be limited to only the Covert Street parking lot being that it is the furthest away from the waterfront area.

*Parking Ticket Fine Changes*

Currently the fine for not paying or parking beyond an expired meter/pay & display ranges from \$20 to \$30. With an increase in daily and monthly rates it will also be imperative that parking fines are increased accordingly. Increases to parking fines will be presented at the February 7 public meeting. If approved by Council, the proposed fines will be updated through a By-law Amendment.

In 2022-2023, By-law Enforcement will be looking at implementing an Administrative Monetary Penalty System (AMPS) system to administer the parking dispute process. The Municipal Act, 2001 allows municipalities to use an Administrative Monetary Penalty System (AMPS) for parking by-law violations. An Administrative Monetary Penalty System is a more efficient way for municipalities to enforce parking by-laws. A Penalty Notice, which is the same as a Parking Ticket, will be issued by enforcement officers for failing to comply with the Town’s Parking By-law. The new process will allow the Town to deal with parking matters in a fair, effective, and efficient manner. It is designed to streamline the enforcement process and is considered a service enhancement because parking violations are no longer disputed through the backlogged court system.

**7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS/BUDGET IMPACTS**

Staff are proposing the following rate increases in consideration of municipal comparator parking rates, recommendations of the 2014 Cobourg Downtown Parking Study as well as recommendations of the Waterfront Working Group. All revenue projections are based on 2017/2018/2019 average revenue numbers.

**Monthly Downtown Parking Lot Pass Recommendations**

Year	Rate / Month	Average Revenue
2017/2018/2019	\$15.00	\$41,564.00
Year	Proposed Rate	Total Projected Revenue
2022	\$25.00	\$69,273.34
2023	\$30.00	\$83,128.01
2024	\$35.00	\$96,982.67

*\*The proposed monthly parking rate for 2022 is equal to the actual 2008 rate before it was reduced to \$15.00.*

**Daily Downtown Parking Permit Rate Recommendations**



Year	Rate / Day	Average Revenue
2017/2018/2019	\$5.00	\$875.00
Year	Proposed Rate	Projected Revenue
2022	\$8.00	\$1,400.00
2023	\$8.00	\$1,400.00
2024	\$10.00	\$1,750.00

*\*Proposal is to limit daily passes at Covert Street lot only*

*\*\*Current daily passes are valid at all downtown municipal parking lots*

### **Downtown Parking Rate Recommendations**

Year	Rate / Hour	Average Revenue
2017/2018/2019	\$1.00	\$152,897.79
Year	Proposed Rate	Projected Revenue
2022	\$1.25	\$191,122.24
2023	\$1.75	\$267,571.14
2024	\$2.25	\$344,020.04

*\*3-hour maximum parking time allotment*

## Waterfront Hourly/Daily Parking Pass and Rate Recommendations

Existing Paid Parking Areas (Figure 2)

Current Hourly (metered)	Current Daily Rate (metered)	Average Revenue
\$2.00	\$16.00 (max 8 hours)	\$204,025.79
Proposed Hourly (metered)	Proposed Daily Rate (pass)	Projected Revenue
\$3.00	\$20.00	\$280,535.46
\$4.00	\$25.00	\$363,420.94
\$5.00	\$40.00	\$510,064.48

\*Projected revenue does not include the addition of parking spots illustrated in Figure 2 therefore revenue projection is low.

\*\*Proposed daily rate is for 11 hours of enforced paid parking 9:00am-8:00pm.

\*\*\*\$5/hr and \$40/day is the recommended rate to implement. Crossed out values are for reference.

Of note, the waterfront daily rate would be best to match or be greater than the cost of the monthly pass rate for the downtown lots. Currently the downtown lots are still substantially cheaper for a monthly pass in comparison to a daily waterfront pass.

If Council endorses an hourly rate of \$3.00 per hour or more, Staff are recommending that existing meters be replaced with Pay & Display or Beacon units (payable by credit card). Due to the amount of additional coin that would be anticipated, meters will become full and jammed more frequently creating more opportunities for vandalism and lost revenue as well as placing additional pressure on By-law enforcement resources to empty the machines more often.

## Waterfront Daily Parking Pass and Rate Recommendations

Proposed New Paid Parking Areas (Figure 3)

Proposed Daily Rate	Projected Revenue
<del>\$20.00</del>	<del>\$328,273.80</del>
<del>\$25.00</del>	<del>\$410,342.25</del>
<del>\$30.00</del>	<del>\$492,410.70</del>
\$40.00	\$586,140.30

\*\$40/day is the recommended rate to implement. Crossed out values are for reference.

## Residential Waterfront Seasonal Parking Pass Rate Recommendations

Proposed Seasonal Rate	Customer
\$20.00	Resident of southeast neighbourhood area

\$40.00	Other resident
---------	----------------

*\*Season pass is valid from Victoria Day to Thanksgiving and in all waterfront parking areas.*

## **Costs Associated with Rate Proposals**

### *Meters and Pay & Display Rate Changes*

Any changes to the metered parking areas in the Downtown or Waterfront will cost approximately \$2,500 for all newer mechanisms to be reprogrammed and all old mechanisms to be replaced as they are not able to accept a rate change. These units will require replacement with a credit card meter (number of units will depend on Council decisions). Pay and display machine rates can be reprogrammed by Staff at no additional cost.

### *Waterfront Infrastructure Upgrades*

Should Council approve an increase in waterfront rates to \$3.00/hour or more, the following changes to infrastructure are required:

- Remove all existing coin meters
- Install pay & display machines as follows:
  - Albert Street lot (1 - will service Albert Street west of Division)
  - Queen Street (2)
  - Charles (1 - will service lot and street parking)
  - McGill (2)
  - Church (3)
  - Paul Currelly Way (1)
- Install credit card meters as follows:
  - Queen (2 double, 2 single between Division and McGill)
  - Division (5 double, south of Albert)

The cost of this infrastructure upgrade will be approximately \$81,000 including supply and installation. Additional operating costs will also apply on an annual basis in the amount of \$12,500. The costs include adding the areas indicated in Figure 2 to the waterfront parking area.

Should Council choose not to increase rates in the waterfront area, it is recommended that older meters start to be changed out with new credit card meters in locations where meters will remain indefinitely (not adequate number of spaces to be serviced by pay & displays). The total cost of \$8,000 would be required for the meter replacements and an annual operating increase of \$1,500.00

## *New Waterfront Parking Area*

Cost associated with implementing paid parking in the residential area to the southeast of Victoria Park will be minimal. Additional signs, posts, and pavement markings will be required at an initial cost of \$3,000. Annual expenses would only increase by \$500 to refresh the pavement markings as signage would be permanent.

### **Summary of Costs**

#### *Downtown Base Scope*

Staff are proposing at minimum a change out of meters to pay & display machines in the downtown on Division Street (west side) north of King Street, Third Street (Albert to King), as well as on Second Street. Also, new credit card meter machines will be installed on King Street (north side) between Spring Street and Ball Street.

Capital: \$26,500

Annual Operating Increase: \$4,000

#### *Downtown Rate Increase*

Should Council approve a rate increase for the downtown, capital and operating costs in addition to the base scope are as follows:

- a) If waterfront meters are approved to be changed out with credit card/pay & displays:

Capital: \$0 (existing newer meter mechanisms can be salvaged and reused in the downtown)

- b) No changes to waterfront parking infrastructure:

Capital: \$15,000 (old meters replaces with credit card meters)

Annual Operating Increase: \$2,500

#### *Waterfront Base Scope*

Staff are proposing at minimum a change out of old meters with new credit card meters where metered parking will remain inevitably.

Capital \$8,000

Annual Operating Increase: \$1,500

#### *Waterfront Full Scope Costs (including base scope)*

Capital \$81,000

Annual Operating Increase: \$12,500

Total for all proposed works:

Capital \$107,500

Annual Operating Increase: \$16,500

## 8. CONCLUSION

That Council receive this report for information purposes and defer further discussions on the parking rate increase proposal to the public meeting on February 7<sup>th</sup> and the February 14<sup>th</sup> Committee of the Whole meeting.

## Report Approval Details

Document Title:	Proposed Parking Rate Increase - Update - Public Works-083-22.docx
Attachments:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Figure 1 Current Waterfront Parking.pdf</li><li>- Figure 2 Existing Paid to Add To Waterfront.pdf</li><li>- Figure 3 Proposed New Waterfront.pdf</li><li>- Figure 4 Proposed Waterfront.pdf</li><li>- TAC Parking Rate Increase Proposal Response (November 25 2021).pdf</li><li>- Comments Summary Parking Proposal.pdf</li></ul>
Final Approval Date:	Jan 14, 2022

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

**Tracey Vaughan, Chief Administrative Officer - Jan 14, 2022 - 1:14 PM**